EXHIBIT 44



Document title: America's Lethal Politics - The New York Times

Capture URL: https://www.nytimes.com/2017/06/14/opinion/steve-

scalise-congress-shot-alexandria-virginia.html? r=1

Captured site IP: 151.101.33.164

Page loaded at (UTC): Fri, 16 Jun 2017 12:59:36 GMT

Capture timestamp (UTC): Fri, 16 Jun 2017 13:09:13 GMT

Capture tool: v5.2.2

Page Vault server IP: 54.174.78.137

Browser engine: Chrome/58.0.3029.81

Operating system: Microsoft Windows NT 6.2.9200.0 (6.2.9200.0)

PDF length: 5

Portal URL: https://portal.page-vault.com/#/snapshot/637372

User: bc-gayla

PAGE VAULT PDF REF#: h85TT8URMQE8eK5VGsTpPH



= SECTIONS

OP-ED CONTRIBUTOR Keep America Wild





DAVID BROOKS Why Fathers Leave Their



ROGER COHEN Israel-Palestine From Both Sides of the Mirror

ID POST: VEUVE CLICOUOT Do You Know What a "Chukker" Is?







The Opinion Pages | EDITORIAL

America's Lethal Politics

By THE EDITORIAL BOARD JUNE 14, 2017













America's elected representatives enjoying America's pastime on a ball field just across the Potomac from the Capitol: A particularly American form of terror changed that idyll early Wednesday morning into what Senator Rand Paul, who was there, called "basically a killing field."

A gunman with a rifle fired dozens of rounds at members of Congress and current and former aides, who dove for cover. "He was hunting us," said Representative Mike Bishop, Republican of Michigan, who was at home plate when the gunman appeared. In all, four victims were hit, including Representative Steve Scalise of Louisiana, the House majority whip, who was in critical condition Wednesday night after surgery on a bullet wound to his hip.

An American would once have been horrified and shocked by such savagery. An American today would be right to be horrified — and not very surprised. This was one of two mass shootings in the United States on Wednesday. At a San Francisco UPS facility, a gunman killed three people and himself.



F.B.I. agents collecting evidence after the shooting at Eugene Simpson Stadium Park in Alexandria, Va.

Not all the details are known yet about what happened in Virginia, but a sickeningly familiar pattern is emerging in the assault: The sniper, James Hodgkinson, who was killed by Capitol Police officers, was surely deranged, and his derangement had found its fuel in politics. Mr. Hodgkinson was a Bernie Sanders supporter and campaign volunteer virulently opposed to President Trump. He posted many anti-Trump messages on social media, including one in March that said "Time to Destroy Trump & Co."

RELATED COVERAGE



Steve Scalise Among 4 Shot at Baseball Field; Suspect Is Dead JUNE 14, 2017



What We Know and Don't Know About the Shooting of the G.O.P. Men's Baseball Team



Opinion | Bret Stephens 'The Indigenous American Berserk' Strikes Again JUNE 15, 2017



Opinion | Charles M. Blow Rhetoric and Bullets JUNE 15, 2017

RECENT COMMENTS

I read the NYT for a reasoned and credible perspective. Those editorial mistakes and retractions are very significant, bearing directly on...

John 10 hours ago I won't be surprised if we end up with some additional gun control with 'Scalise' in the title. This is the typical US approach to gun...

Karen E 11 bours ago

Statistics don't lie . In the states with the most lax gun laws there are the highest gun death rates per capita, as opposed to

SEE ALL COMMENTS

Document title: America's Lethal Politics -The New York Times

Capture URL: https://www.nytimes.com/2017/06/14/opinion/steve-scalise-congress-shot-alexandria-virginia.html? r=1

Capture timestamp (UTC): Fri, 16 Jun 2017 13:09:13 GMT

Page 1 of 4

Case 1:17-cv-04853-JSR Document 109-44 Filed 07/11/20













E a



The Opinion Pages | America's Lethal Politics



DAVID BROOKS Why Fathers Leave Their Children



ROGER COHEN Israel-Palestine From Both Sides of the Mirror

ID POST: VEUVE CLICOUOT Do You Know What a "Chukker" Is?







Was this attack evidence of how vicious American politics has become? Probably. In 2011, Jared Lee Loughner opened fire in a supermarket parking lot, grievously wounding Representative Gabby Giffords and killing six people, including a 9-year-old girl. At the time, we and others were sharply critical of the heated political rhetoric on the right. Before the shooting, Sarah Palin's political action committee circulated a map that showed the targeted electoral districts of Ms. Giffords and 19 other Democrats under stylized cross hairs. But in that case no connection to the shooting was ever established.

Conservatives and right-wing media were quick on Wednesday to demand forceful condemnation of hate speech and crimes by anti-Trump liberals. They're right. Liberals should of course be held to the same standard of decency that they ask of the right.

Was this attack evidence of how readily available guns and ammunition are in the United States? Indisputably. Mr. Hodgkinson, by definition, should not have had a gun, but he was licensed in his home state, Illinois. And in any event it would have been easy for him to acquire a weapon in Virginia, which requires no background checks in private sales, requires no registration for most weapons and has few restrictions on open carry.

Sign Up for the Opinion Today Newsletter Every weekday, get thought-provoking commentary from Op-Ed columnists, the Times editorial board and contributing writers from around the world Enter your email address Sign Up You agree to receive occasional updates and special offers for The New York Times's products and services I'm not a robot SEE SAMPLE | PRIVACY POLICY | OPT OUT OR CONTACT US ANYTIME

The reaction of some was that the only solution is yet more guns. Representative Mo Brooks of Alabama, who was among those who came under fire on Wednesday, said, "It's not easy to take when you see people around you being shot and you don't have a weapon yourself."

That's an entirely reasonable reflex. All people in that situation, unarmed and under fire, would long to be able to protect themselves and their friends. Yet consider the society Americans would have to live in

- the choices they would all have to make - to enable that kind of defense. Every member of Congress, and every other American of whatever age, would have to go to baseball practice, or to school, or to work, or to the post office, or to the health clinic — or to any of the other places mass shootings now take place — with a gun on their hip. And then, when an attack came and they returned fire, they would probably kill or wound not the assailant but another innocent bystander, as studies have repeatedly shown.

That is the society the gun lobby is working toward. Is it the one Americans

President Trump said just the right thing after the attack on Wednesday: "We may have our differences, but we do well in times like these to remember that everyone who serves in our nation's capital is here because,







Document title: America's Lethal Politics -The New York Times

Capture URL: https://www.nytimes.com/2017/06/14/opinion/steve-scalise-congress-shot-alexandria-virginia.html? r=1 Capture timestamp (UTC): Fri, 16 Jun 2017 13:09:13 GMT

Page 2 of 4

Expert







T a



The Opinion Pages | America's Lethal Politics



DAVID BROOKS Why Fathers Leave Their



ROGER COHEN Israel-Palestine From Both Sides of the Mirror

Brilliant Business Phones

Visit Site

Warning: Do not use your business phone until you read this

D POST: VEUVE CLICOUOT Do You Know What a "Chukker" Is?





"We may have our differences, but we do well in times like these to remember that everyone who serves in our nation's capital is here because, above all, they love our country. We can all agree that we are blessed to be Americans, that our children deserve to grow up in a nation of safety and

Yet he will not help create that nation if he continues to advocate easy access to lethal weapons.

Correction: June 16, 2017

An editorial on Thursday about the shooting of Representative Steve Scalise incorrectly stated that a link existed between political rhetoric and the 2011 shooting of Representative Gabby Giffords. In fact, no such link was established. The editorial also incorrectly described a map distributed by a political action committee before that shooting. It depicted electoral districts, not individual Democratic lawmakers, beneath stulized cross hairs.

Follow The New York Times Opinion section on Facebook and Twitter (@NYTopinion), and sign up for the Opinion Today newsletter

A version of this editorial appears in print on June 15, 2017, on Page A24 of the New York edition with the headline:

RELATED COVERAGE

Steve Scalise Among 4 Shot at Baseball Field; Suspect Is Dead JUNE 14, 2017



What We Know and Don't Know About the Shooting of the G.O.P. Men's Baseball Team JUNE 14, 2017



Opinion Bret Stephens 'The Indigenous American Berserk' Strikes Again



Opinion Charles M. Blow Rhetoric and Bullets JUNE 15, 2017



More in Opinion



OP-ED CONTRIBUTOR Keep America Wild



EDITORIAL Mr. Trump, Afghanistan Is Your War Now



PAID POST: ESURANCE The Technology That Could **Eliminate Distracted Driving**



DAVID BROOKS Why Fathers Leave Their Children



ROGER COHEN Israel-Palestine From Both Sides of the Mirror



CONTRIBUTING OP-ED WRITER Presidential Youth Envy

Recommended for You







TRENDING

3.

Russian Military Says It Might Have Killed 1. ISIS Leader



Trump Transition Team Orders Former Aides 2 to Preserve Russia-Related Materials Op-Ed Columnist: Why Fathers Leave Their



Best of Late Night: Stephen Colbert Disagrees That Trump Is the Subject of a 'Witch Hunt'



Mueller, Known for Being Above the Fray, Is Now in the Thick of It



Otto Warmbier Was 'Brutalized and Terrorized' in North Korea, Father Says



The Dutch Have Solutions to Rising Seas. The World Is Watching.



Inside Wealth: At Last, Jeff Bezos Offers a Hint of His Philanthropic Plans



London Fire's Death Toll Rises to 30; Some Victims Might Never Be Identified



Secrecy Surrounding Senate Health Bill Raises Alarms in Both Parties



View More Trending Stories »

The Opinion Pages | America's Lethal Politics













T a



EDITORIAL Mr. Trump, Afghanistan Is Your War Now



DAVID BROOKS Why Fathers Leave Their



ROGER COHEN Israel-Palestine From Both Sides of the Mirror

ID POST: VEUVE CLICOUOT Do You Know What a "Chukker" Is?





Snooting of the G.O.r. Mens Daseball Team

JUNE 14, 2017

Opinion Bret Stephens

'The Indigenous American Berserk' Strikes Again

Opinion Charles M. Blow Rhetoric and Bullets JUNE 15, 2017





More in Opinion



Keep America Wild

DAVID BROOKS

Children

Why Fathers Leave Their



Mr. Trump, Afghanistan Is Your War Now

Israel-Palestine From Both

Sides of the Mirror



PAID POST: ESURANCE The Technology That Could **Eliminate Distracted Driving**



CONTRIBUTING OP-ED WRITER Presidential Youth Envy

TRENDING Go to the Opinion Section »







Trump Transition Team Orders Former Aides



Best of Late Night: Stephen Colbert Disagrees That Trump Is the Subject of a 'Witch Hunt'



Mueller, Known for Being Above the Fray, Is Now in the Thick of It



Otto Warmbier Was 'Brutalized and Terrorized' in North Korea, Father Says

World Is Watching.



Inside Wealth: At Last, Jeff Bezos Offers a Hint of His Philanthropic Plans



London Fire's Death Toll Rises to 30; Some Victims Might Never Be Identified Secrecy Surrounding Senate Health Bill

Raises Alarms in Both Parties

View More Trending Stories »







Their Own Targeted, Republicans Want Looser Gun Laws, Not Stricter Ones

The New Hork Times



ON WASHINGTON Shaken Lawmakers Soften Partisan Tone While Uniting in



Congressional Baseball: A Show of Unity on the Ball Field

Go to All Recommendations a



NEWS OPINION ARTS LIVING LISTINGS & MORE World Today's Opinion Today's Arts Automobiles Classifieds U.S. **Op-Ed Columnists** Art & Design Crossword Tools & Services Politics Editorials Times Topics Food Books Contributing Writers Education Public Editor Business Op-Ed Contributors Movies Fashion & Style N.Y.C. Events Guide Health Tech Opinionator Music Blogs Science Letters N.Y.C. Events Guide Jobs Multimedia Health Sunday Review Television Magazine Photography N.Y.C. Events Guide Sports Taking Note Theater Video Education Room for Debate Video: Arts Real Estate NYT Store Public Editor T Magazine Obituaries Times Journeys Today's Paper Video: Opinion Travel Subscribe Weddings & Corrections Manage My Account

Home Delivery **™** Digital Subscriptions

Crossword

SUBSCRIBE

Email Newsletters Gift Subscriptions Corporate Subscriptions **Education Rate**

Mobile Applications Replica Edition

© 2017 The New York Times Company | Contact Us | Work With Us | Advertise | Your Ad Choices | Privacy | Terms of Service | Terms of Sale

Site Map | Help | Site Feedback | Subscriptions

Document title: America's Lethal Politics -The New York Times

Capture timestamp (UTC): Fri, 16 Jun 2017 13:09:13 GMT

Capture URL: https://www.nytimes.com/2017/06/14/opinion/steve-scalise-congress-shot-alexandria-virginia.html? r=1

PALIN02737